Markets, Algorithms, Incentives, and Networks

Seminar WS 2016/17

First meeting
October 21, 2016

Johannes Hofbauer and Christian Saile
Plan for Today

• Round of introduction
• The big picture
• Scheduling of talks
• Tasks
  ‣ As a speaker
  ‣ As a regular attendant
  ‣ As a session chair
• Road to a solid seminar talk
• Feedback
• Grading
Round of Introduction

• Get together in groups of three (with people you do not yet know)
• Briefly introduce yourself to your partners
• You then introduce yourself to the whole group
• Please make sure you include
  ‣ Name, field of study, semester
  ‣ Your expectations towards the seminar
  ‣ A surprising fact about you
The Big Picture

- Six key topics at the intersection of economics and computation

**Games**
- Simultaneous-Move Games
- Finding an equilibrium

**Auctions**
- Auction Design
- Combinatorial Auctions

**Welfare**
- Price of Anarchy

**Information**
- Privacy

**Markets**
- Matching Markets
- Digital Currencies

**Networks**
- Networks
- Games on Networks
Related Courses

• Summer semesters
  ‣ Course & Tutorial Algorithmic Game Theory (Prof. Brandt)
    - Utility theory, normal-form games, stable matchings
  ‣ Course & Tutorial Operations Research (WI IV) (Prof. Bichler)
    - Decision theory, linear programming, discrete optimization
  ‣ Seminar Economics and Computation (Prof. Brandt)
    - Advanced research seminar (master level)

• Winter semesters
  ‣ Course & Tutorial Computational Social Choice (Prof. Brandt)
    - Rational choice, voting rules, impossibility theorems
  ‣ Course Auction Theory & Market Design (Prof. Bichler)
    - Combinatorial auctions, spectrum license auctions, procurement
Rough Schedule (Reminder)

- Three morning presentations
- Two afternoon presentations
- Presentation:
  - Talk (30-45 min)
  - Feedback & Discussions (20-25 min)
  - Break (15 min)
# Dates and Roles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Speaker</th>
<th>Chair</th>
<th>Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dec 02</td>
<td>09.00 - 16.30</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Oskar</td>
<td>Augusto</td>
<td>01.10.033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Maximilian</td>
<td>Tuan Anh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Dominik S.</td>
<td>Dominik I.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>Lukas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Aykut</td>
<td>Frederik</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec 16</td>
<td>09.00 - 16.30</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Frederik</td>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>01.10.033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Lukas</td>
<td>Aykut</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Dominik I.</td>
<td>Oskar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Tuan Anh</td>
<td>Maximilian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Augusto</td>
<td>Dominik S.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tasks as a Speaker

• **Before talk**
  - Discuss outline with supervisor (~2-3 weeks before talk; schedule time by email to avoid disappointment)
  - Prepare presentation and handout (~3-5 pages) (goal of handout: prepare participants for your talk and help them understand the topic)
  - Practice presentation
  - Email handout to all participants (incl. your supervisor)
    - Deadline: one week before talk

• **During talk**
  - Ask at least one insightful (!) question and give the audience some time (~1-2 min) to think about/discuss it

• **After talk**
  - Answer questions of the audience (possibly also during talk)
Tasks as a Regular Attendant

● **Before talk**
  ▶ Read handout (and book chapter if helpful)
  ▶ Email questions/comments to the session chair
    - Deadline: two days before talk

● **After talk**
  ▶ Give (qualitative) feedback
  ▶ Participate in discussion
Tasks as a Session Chair

• **Before talk**
  ▸ Consolidate and structure/group questions
    - One (!) list; but include names of authors (for each question); see provided LaTeX-template
    - Email list to speaker and your supervisor at least one day before the talk
  ▸ Introduce speaker (short)

• **During talk**
  ▸ Keep track of time and give signals to the speaker

• **After talk**
  ▸ Ask audience for feedback
    - Take feedback notes for the speaker
  ▸ Actively lead discussion
    - Use consolidated questions if appropriate
Deadlines (Reminder)

• To be done before the presentation
  ‣ 2-3 weeks (speaker): discuss outline with supervisor
  ‣ 1 week (speaker): email handout to everyone
  ‣ 2 days (everyone): email questions/comments to the session chair
  ‣ 1 day (chair): email consolidated (!) questions to speaker and supervisor

  ‣ 1 week before = Thursday end of day
  ‣ 2 days before = Tuesday end of day
  ‣ 1 day before = Wednesday end of day
Road to a Solid Seminar Talk

- Study your material thoroughly, you are the expert!
- Think about which material you want to present and discuss it with your supervisor (we may give you additional material)
- Decide how you want to present the material
- Ask with supervisor if something is unclear
- (Possibly) coordinate with the student who speaks about a related topic
- Think of questions you can ask the audience during the talk
- Practice your presentation several times
A General Note on Feedback

- Do not underestimate the value of feedback!
- Everyone should want to give good talks
- To improve, you have to find out where your strengths and weaknesses are
- While you can try to observe yourself (recommended!), there are things that only others notice or that you would have misjudged
  - e.g. ‘speaking’: too fast/slow? clearly enough? monotonous? etc.
  - did something on purpose, but the effect was not as intended?
- There are few occasions where you actually get feedback
- Therefore, **appreciate** it whenever someone makes the effort to give you feedback!
Providing/Receiving Feedback

• Unfortunately, neither giving nor receiving feedback is easy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step 1</th>
<th>Step 2</th>
<th>Step 3</th>
<th>Step 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Providing</td>
<td>State observations</td>
<td>Explain impressions/feelings</td>
<td>Check for understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receiving</td>
<td>Listen!</td>
<td>Listen!</td>
<td>Ask clarifying (!) questions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Given the difficulty: Step 0 - **Think and reflect**

• Feedback “rules” can help us *(see course homepage for details)*
  ‣ stay “on the right track”
  ‣ tell us what to look out for
Grading

• **Performance as a speaker** (~60%)
  ‣ Choice of material
  ‣ Presentation
  ‣ Coping with questions

• **Handout** (~15%)

• **Performance as a regular attendant and session chair** (~25%)
  ‣ Questions for the speaker
  ‣ Discussions (quality, frequency)
  ‣ Consolidation of questions for speaker
  ‣ Leading of discussion
Questions about the seminar?

See you on December 2nd!